Comment on wcd-2022-36
Irina Rudeva (Editor)

Editor comment on "The three-dimensional structure of fronts in mid-latitude weather systems as represented by numerical weather prediction models" by Andreas Alexander Beckert et al., Weather Clim. Dynam. Discuss., https://doi.org/10.5194/wcd-2022-36-EC1, 2022

Dear Authors,

Thank you for submitting your manuscript to WCD. Unfortunately, based on the evaluation of two reviewers, I believe that the submitted version of the paper is not well suited for publishing in WCD. Your willingness to reach out to a wider audience is very much appreciated; however, both reviewers noted that the submitted manuscript has not provided significant advancement of our understanding of weather and climate dynamics, which is the scope of WCD.

Therefore, I recommend withdrawing the paper and re-evaluating it. If the main goal remains documenting the 3D tool and providing guidance on how it can be used by other researchers then I suggest following the reviewers’ advice on submitting the manuscript to GMD. If you choose to focus more on atmospheric dynamics facilitated by the 3D tool, then such study can be considered for WCD as a new submission. I believe that such paper may still achieve your goal to introduce the 3D frontal algorithm to the meteorological community.

If you decide to submit the paper to GMD, you are welcome to mention that the paper has been previously discussed in WCD and was recommended for submission to GMD. I’ll be happy to assist the new GMD editor should they contact me.

Please feel free to contact me if you need any further information.

Kind regards,
Irina