

## ***Interactive comment on “A new automatic approach for extracting glacier centerlines” by Dahong Zhang et al.***

**Fabien Maussion**

fabien.maussion@uibk.ac.at

Received and published: 2 November 2020

Dear authors,

thank you for what looks like an interesting new way to compute glacier centerlines.

I would like to bring to your attention that there is an open-source python implementation of the Kienholz et al. 2014 algorithm. The method is available as part of the OGGM modelling framework (<https://oggm.org/>, Maussion et al., 2019). The implementation and parameters are not "one to one" the same as in Kienholz et al. 2014 but similar enough to allow a fair comparison of your method with previously available ones. I think that your manuscript would gain by making this comparison.

Furthermore, I would like to mention that "Code and results are available upon re-  
C1

quest" statements are against this journal's data policies ([https://www.the-cryosphere.net/policies/data\\_policy.html](https://www.the-cryosphere.net/policies/data_policy.html)). These practices are detrimental to the review process and to science in general. I would highly recommend to publish your code and centerlines in an openly accessible repository and with a clear software license, in particular if you suggest to use your code instead of previous methods for the generation of the RGI's centerlines.

Best regards,

Fabien Maussion

### **References**

Kienholz, C., Rich, J. L., Arendt, A. A., and Hock, R.: A new method for deriving glacier centerlines applied to glaciers in Alaska and northwest Canada, *The Cryosphere*, 8, 503–519, doi: 10.5194/tc-8-503-2014, 2014.

Maussion, F., Butenko, A., Champollion, N., Dusch, M., Eis, J., Fourteau, K., Gregor, P., Jarosch, A. H., Landmann, J., Oesterle, F., Recinos, B., Rothenpieler, T., Vlug, A., Wild, C. T., and Marzeion, B.: The Open Global Glacier Model (OGGM) v1.1, *Geosci. Model Dev.*, 12, 909–931, <https://doi.org/10.5194/gmd-12-909-2019>, 2019.

---

Interactive comment on The Cryosphere Discuss., <https://doi.org/10.5194/tc-2020-294>, 2020.