

SOIL Discuss., referee comment RC1
<https://doi.org/10.5194/soil-2021-76-RC1>, 2021
© Author(s) 2021. This work is distributed under
the Creative Commons Attribution 4.0 License.



Comment on soil-2021-76

Anonymous Referee #1

Referee comment on "The effect of natural infrastructure on water erosion mitigation in the Andes" by Veerle Vanacker et al., SOIL Discuss.,
<https://doi.org/10.5194/soil-2021-76-RC1>, 2021

Dear Editirs,

You will find in attachment a file with my comments for the authors.

"The effect of natural infrastructure on water erosion mitigation in the Andes"

This study shows interesting results through a systematic review of 121 case-studies from the Andes to define useful erosion indicators i) Effectiveness of natural infrastructure? Ii) Impact of working with natural infrastructure on on-site and off-site erosion mitigation? Iii) locations and types of studies necessary to complete knowledge and research.

Weak point: some information or references about sites/countries and rain characteristics are unclear or missing because the research of the studies is done by a specific selection of key words.

Strong point: the overview of the references is well analysed.

With some improvements, especially verifying the interest of specific references, in the definition of the erosion/erodibility parameters, and the conclusion-perspectives this paper could provide a relevant review for the research community working on different aspect of Andes mountains "ecology" (interaction soil, water, vegetation) and more generally for erosion processes studies.

Please also note the supplement to this comment:

<https://soil.copernicus.org/preprints/soil-2021-76/soil-2021-76-RC1-supplement.pdf>