

SOIL Discuss., referee comment RC1  
<https://doi.org/10.5194/soil-2021-37-RC1>, 2021  
© Author(s) 2021. This work is distributed under  
the Creative Commons Attribution 4.0 License.

## **Comment on soil-2021-37**

Anonymous Referee #1

---

Referee comment on "The geographical distribution of soil elements determines the boundaries of the Daodi-zone of medicinal plant (*Ligusticum chuanxiong* Hort.)" by Hongyang Lv et al., SOIL Discuss., <https://doi.org/10.5194/soil-2021-37-RC1>, 2021

---

This manuscript reports the chemical properties (contents of some macro and microelements, organic C, and pH) of soil samples collected from 37 locations of the Sichuan province in China, as well as the chemical composition of rhizomes of *Ligusticum chuanxiong* (used in Chinese medicine) sampled from the same locations. These analyses were mainly intended to identify the geographical area of high-quality production (Daodi zone) of this plant species.

While the data reported here might be of regional interest, the manuscript is almost entirely descriptive and fails to provide any new insights into scientific questions of broader relevance to Soil Science. Another major issue with this manuscript is the quality of the presentation and its clarity. The manuscript is not well structured. Methods and results are mixed and the objectives are not clearly stated, among other issues. It is difficult to understand what the authors are trying to convey throughout the entire text. Unfortunately, I do not think that this manuscript is ready for a more detailed review.