

SOIL Discuss., referee comment RC2
<https://doi.org/10.5194/soil-2021-3-RC2>, 2021
© Author(s) 2021. This work is distributed under
the Creative Commons Attribution 4.0 License.



Comment on soil-2021-3

Anonymous Referee #2

Referee comment on "Soil organic carbon mobility in equatorial podzols: soil column experiments" by Patricia Merdy et al., SOIL Discuss.,
<https://doi.org/10.5194/soil-2021-3-RC2>, 2021

See uploaded PDF for specific comments and suggestions

Additional general comments:

Abstract: please state the overall aim/objective of the study and perhaps a short sentence on the overall implications of the findings.

Throughout:

- you refer to a number of hypotheses, but these are neither explicitly laid out nor rigorously tested. It would be better to replace the term hypothesis with the 'notion' or 'suggestion' or 'interpretation'
- for clarity I would refrain from using 'significant' unless based on statistical testing

Conclusion: would you be able to add a sentence or two on the wider implications of the findings?

Please also note the supplement to this comment:

<https://soil.copernicus.org/preprints/soil-2021-3/soil-2021-3-RC2-supplement.pdf>