

Solid Earth Discuss., editor comment EC2
<https://doi.org/10.5194/se-2021-70-EC2>, 2022
© Author(s) 2022. This work is distributed under
the Creative Commons Attribution 4.0 License.



Comment on se-2021-70

Virginia Toy (Editor)

Editor comment on "Raman spectroscopy in thrust-stacked carbonates: an investigation of spectral parameters in strained samples" by Lauren Kedar et al., Solid Earth Discuss., <https://doi.org/10.5194/se-2021-70-EC2>, 2022

Dear Lauren

Thank you for making the revisions and submitting a revised manuscript. I am generally happy that your responses to the reviews address the major concerns previously expressed, but since I am not an expert in the topic and the revisions were substantial, I have requested that the first reviewer examine your responses and the revised manuscript again.

Additionally, if you are offered another chance to revise the manuscript after this re-review, please consider more minor revisions to accommodate this idea: In many cases you respond reasonably to reviewers comments but have not modified the manuscript text to reflect that. I think that you should include as much of the information that you put into the responses to the reviewer as possible in the revised manuscript. Examples include (but are not limited to): responses to Dr. Jubb's review, Q3, e.g. about the mesh size that samples were served to, and the evidence that graphitisation has not occurred. Similarly, your response to Prof. Rahl's comment about Lines 460 and 465.

Regards, Virginia Toy