

Solid Earth Discuss., referee comment RC3  
<https://doi.org/10.5194/se-2021-108-RC3>, 2021  
© Author(s) 2021. This work is distributed under  
the Creative Commons Attribution 4.0 License.



## Comment on se-2021-108

Gregor Partington (Referee)

---

Referee comment on "Rare earth elements associated with carbonatite–alkaline complexes in western Rajasthan, India: exploration targeting at regional scale" by Malcolm Aranha et al., Solid Earth Discuss., <https://doi.org/10.5194/se-2021-108-RC3>, 2021

---

The paper REEs associated with carbonatite-alkaline complexes in western Rajasthan, India: exploration targeting at regional-scale by Malcolm Aranha, Alok Porwal, Manikandan Sundaralingam, Ignacio González-Álvarez, Amber Markan and Karunakar Rao<sup>3</sup> provides a study that will interest not only researchers into mineral resources spatial data modelling but also researchers into REE mineralisation and industry explorationists and it appropriate for the Journal.

The paper describes the study and results in a well written and structured paper. There are minor edits that are provided in the attached review of the paper.

The main issue with the paper is the number and length of tables that make reading the paper difficult. The information in the tables, however, is very useful and should be included. I would suggest that some of the larger tables are moved to either appendices or a supplementary data section. This will improve the structure and readability of the paper without losing important information.

There are some improvements that can be made to the description of the targets and the Discussion and Recommendations section which are highlighted in the attached review.

There are minor issues with the references in the paper with some cited and not referenced and vice versa. Please see the attached.

If these issues are addressed the paper can be published.

Please also note the supplement to this comment:

<https://se.copernicus.org/preprints/se-2021-108/se-2021-108-RC3-supplement.pdf>