

Solid Earth Discuss., author comment AC2
<https://doi.org/10.5194/se-2020-218-AC2>, 2021
© Author(s) 2021. This work is distributed under
the Creative Commons Attribution 4.0 License.



Reply on RC2

Stefano Urbani et al.

Author comment on "Reply to Norini and Groppelli's comment on "Estimating the depth and evolution of intrusions at resurgent calderas: Los Humeros (Mexico)" by Urbani et al. (2020)" by Stefano Urbani et al., Solid Earth Discuss.,
<https://doi.org/10.5194/se-2020-218-AC2>, 2021

We warmly thank the reviewer John Browning for the comments provided on our Reply. We will change the text according to his suggestions. Hereafter, we also provide a detailed reply on the reviewer's major comments:

COMMENT Line 34: Are they referring to the quality of the data? I would suggest the word quality is added after the word poor. Or are they referring to the coverage or absence of data? Either way i think there needs to be a qualifying word after the word poor to focus what is 'poor' about the data.

ANSWER: We suppose that they are referring to the absence of data. Therefore, we will change the word poor with "lack of".

COMMENT Line 96: Only for interest the authors may also wish to read the following manuscript which reported similar results but for the Karliova triple junction region in Turkey. I am in no way suggesting this should be cited here, i just mention it for interest. Karaoğlu, Ö., Bazargan, M., Baba, A. and Browning, J., 2019. Thermal fluid circulation around the Karliova triple junction: Geochemical features and volcano-tectonic implications (Eastern Turkey). *Geothermics*, 81, pp.168-184.

ANSWER: We thank the reviewer for bringing this interesting article to our attention. We see no harm in citing the suggested article that can be of interest also for the external reader. Therefore, on our own initiative, we will cite it in the revised version of the manuscript.

COMMENT Line 154: I think that this final statement is also slightly unclear. What do you mean by 'their own statements are really unclear'? This should be reworded to be stronger and more precise. Do you mean that their comments are contradictory?

ANSWER: We will replace the term "unclear" with "contradictory" in the revised text.

COMMENT Lines 157-158: I find this sentence hard to follow and difficult to understand what you want to convey. Please rephrase.

ANSWER: We will rephrase the sentence as follows: "Norini and Gropelli 2020 invoke the thermal profile and the stratigraphy of just one well log (H4 well, drilled on the top of the Loma Blanca bulge) to claim the lack of validation of the models proposed in Urbani et al. (2020)"

COMMENT Line 301: I find this statement somewhat antagonizing. I would suggest that the authors remove this to avoid any further back and forth comments which at this stage should really be avoided.

ANSWER: We will delete the statement as suggested by the reviewer.

COMMENT Lines 303-308: I find all of these final comments somewhat strange and i would suggest they be removed. I agree in part that much of this comment stream seems unnecessary, especially since many of the authors of the competing comments have worked and published together on the same topic. So there appears to be a lot of cross-over which is verging on inappropriate.

ANSWER: We totally agree with the reviewer that the back and forth comments made by the authors of the "comment" are inappropriate as already expressed by one of the co-authors in the discussion forum. We think that these final statements are not against the authors of the "comment" and were added to the text to explain the context from which such scientific debate has started. This would have helped to clarify the nature of part of the comment stream that we believe inappropriate and unnecessary as already pointed out by the reviewer. However, we recognize that such a matter might not be of interest for an external reader thus, if the Editor agrees, we will remove it from the text as suggested.

Yours sincerely,

Stefano Urbani, Guido Giordano, Federico Lucci, Federico Rossetti and Gerardo Carrasco Nuñez.