Nonlinear Processes in Geophysics Discussions

Nonlin. Processes Geophys. Discuss., community comment CC1
https://doi.org/10.5194/npg-2022-9-CC1, 2022


# Comment on npg-2022-9

Dmitri Kondrashov

Community comment on "Fortnight conditioning of historical data to improve short-term precipitation predictions" by Yoshito Hirata and Yoshinori Yamada, Nonlin. Processes Geophys. Discuss., https://doi.org/10.5194/npg-2022-9-CC1, 2022

I am simply not convinced by this paper, it is very short with one figure and is not up to the standards and depth expected for NPG. Authors need to heavily revise and extend the manuscript to improve presentation and their arguments. Hopefully my comments below are helpful.

The authors argue that short-term (2hr ahead) time series prediction for precipitation at Tokyo station in 1-min sampling can be improved by using data two weeks in the past and some form of analogs method. This is similar to looking for needle in a haystack and I find it very doubtful without additional analysis and presentation. First of all it would be helpful to show time series. Secondly, are there any periodicities in the time series itself by using classical spectral analysis methods? Finally, they should think on how to better present and illustrate their prediction method, perhaps using some toy model data, not simply as a short appendix.