

Nonlin. Processes Geophys. Discuss., referee comment RC3
<https://doi.org/10.5194/npg-2022-15-RC3>, 2022
© Author(s) 2022. This work is distributed under
the Creative Commons Attribution 4.0 License.

Reply on CC2

Tamas Bodai (Referee)

Referee comment on "The Role of Internal Variability in Regional Climate Change" by Clara Deser and Adam S. Phillips, Nonlin. Processes Geophys. Discuss.,
<https://doi.org/10.5194/npg-2022-15-RC3>, 2022

Dear Paul,

You replied my comment. I agree with you that in observed signals we can have unaccounted for forced components. Isn't it trivial in the light of the fact that we do not fully know the governing equations of the observed phenomenon. We usually add a noise term that represents the lack of knowledge beside what we seem to know.

Having said that, I feel that your comment as a reply to me is off-topic because I concern the question whether and ensemble E-statistic like the E-mean represents the forced response or not. This question arises in the context of a MODEL where we can only produce the simulation data with a well posed problem on hand, HAVING a set of equations representing all the the internal dynamics and external forcings.

Best wishes,

Tamas