

Nat. Hazards Earth Syst. Sci. Discuss., referee comment RC1  
<https://doi.org/10.5194/nhess-2022-91-RC1>, 2022  
© Author(s) 2022. This work is distributed under  
the Creative Commons Attribution 4.0 License.

## Comment on nhess-2022-91

Anonymous Referee #1

---

Referee comment on "Design and application of a multi-hazard risk rapid assessment questionnaire for hill communities in the Indian Himalayan region" by Shivani Chouhan and Mahua Mukherjee, Nat. Hazards Earth Syst. Sci. Discuss.,  
<https://doi.org/10.5194/nhess-2022-91-RC1>, 2022

---

- Topic selected for study is appropriate, however, the treatment is not up to the mark.
- References cited are not correct and some references are missing.
- Paper claims about multi hazard risk assessment, however, there is not explanation given on how various hazards and risks are integrated.
- Table 2 show the comparison of survey forms. Some of the hazards mentioned are not relevant to the methods listed, e.g., NDMA forms is only meant to earthquake risk, it has no mention of floods, 2) There is no mention of high winds in BMTPC form. It is suggested to mention only the objectives for which the individual forms have been generated.
- Also, manuscript is largely in the report format I.e., with bullets and objective mentioned in the form of flow chart. It is suggested to follow research paper.
- Refereces:
  - Some of the links provided as references are not either not available or there no paper by that references.
  - E.g. 1) Pradesh, H., Pradeep, R. and Anoop, K. (2016) 'Rapid visual screening of different housing typologies', *Natural Hazards*. Springer Netherlands. doi: 10.1007/s11069-016-2668-3.
  - Full author list is needed in the paper "Aksha, S. K. *et al.* (2020) 'A geospatial analysis of multi-hazard risk in', *Geomatics, Natural Hazards and Risk*. 604 Taylor & Francis, 11(1), pp. 88–111. doi: 10.1080/19475705.2019.1710580."
  - IS-1893 has been revised in 2016. Subsequently there were two amendments. However, authors still use 2002 version.
- Authors have prepared a comprehensive multi-hazard form however, they have not indicated how the multi-hazard is computed.
- Title of the paper says "Design and Testing of Multi-hazard Rapid assessment questionnaire". However, neither Design part is not discussed in detail nor the testing part is not discussed. It is suggested to include the same for better understanding by the readers.