Natural Hazards and Earth System Sciences
Discussions

Nat. Hazards Earth Syst. Sci. Discuss., referee comment RC2
https://doi.org/10.5194/nhess-2022-4-RC2, 2022
© Author(s) 2022. This work is distributed under
the Creative Commons Attribution 4.0 License.

CC1 again as RC

Eric Strobl (Referee)

Referee comment on "Assessing the impacts of tropical cyclones on rice production in Bangladesh, Myanmar, Philippines, and Vietnam" by Kai Wan Yuen et al., Nat. Hazards Earth Syst. Sci. Discuss., https://doi.org/10.5194/nhess-2022-4-RC2, 2022

This study collects data on relevant tropical cyclones, and their damages to rice production across three countries from a variety of sources. As such the information is useful as a set of preliminary statistics. However, the analysis needs to go much further and try to disentangle what aspects of tropical cyclones drive the observed damages. In particular this requires creating a more detailed data set of the locally experienced wind speeds, the location of rice, the timing relative to the growing season, the amount of locally experienced windfields etc. These data would then need to be subjected to a regression analysis to properly identify what is driving observed differences in damages. Only then can the results be considered meaning and useful for policymakers and future research. May I also note that gathering data on ex-post reported damages as the authors do here is likely to involve selection bias (in terms of the reporting) and measurement error, that would need to be addressed, or at the very least discussed.

Thus, while the effort in data collection should be applauded, this in and of itself does not merit publication. A thorough analysis of the data in the lines suggested above would certainly be required.