

Nat. Hazards Earth Syst. Sci. Discuss., referee comment RC1  
<https://doi.org/10.5194/nhess-2022-270-RC1>, 2023  
© Author(s) 2023. This work is distributed under  
the Creative Commons Attribution 4.0 License.

## Comment on nhess-2022-270

Anonymous Referee #1

---

Referee comment on "Characteristics of debris flows recorded in the Shenmu area of central Taiwan between 2004 and 2021" by Yi-Min Huang, Nat. Hazards Earth Syst. Sci. Discuss., <https://doi.org/10.5194/nhess-2022-270-RC1>, 2023

---

The author presented a valuable manuscript for a debris flow monitoring site. However, there are some issues needed to complete the manuscript.

- The abstract should provide a general idea of this study, which includes the importance, the design, the process, and most important the finding from the data. The author should consider rewriting the abstract.
- The introduction should provide a basic idea of the literature and methods, which is lacking in the present form.
- Some names are different in Figure 1 and Figure 2.
- The author presents the debris period to 2021 but the data shown in tables and figures stopped in 2017.
- In line 66, the author mentions that the Aiyuzi stream is the focus of this study but the manuscript keeps mentioning the other two streams.
- In lines 115 to 116, the rainfall event with 1550 mm is missing in Table 2.
- The landslide increment seems incorrect when comparing Table 1 and Table 3.
- In line 205, "Different trends" seems the same trend in Fig. 11.
- In line 216, the velocity before 2009 has only one data and is not the same as 14.4 m/sec in Table 6.
- The soil moisture sensor can be withdrawn from the manuscript since there is no good or enough data to analyze.
- The findings from the geophone should have more descriptions and discussions with such valuable data.
- The first paragraph of the conclusions says the effective rainfall changed from 250mm to 300mm but the result is not shown in the previous part of this manuscript.
- The 3<sup>rd</sup> paragraph of the conclusions says that the frequency of debris flow is different with 1.83 and 0.75 times but cannot be seen in the previous part of this manuscript.