

Nat. Hazards Earth Syst. Sci. Discuss., referee comment RC2
<https://doi.org/10.5194/nhess-2021-46-RC2>, 2021
© Author(s) 2021. This work is distributed under
the Creative Commons Attribution 4.0 License.

Comment on nhess-2021-46

Anonymous Referee #2

Referee comment on "Changes in drought features at the European level over the last 120 years" by Monica Ionita and Viorica Nagavciuc, Nat. Hazards Earth Syst. Sci. Discuss., <https://doi.org/10.5194/nhess-2021-46-RC2>, 2021

The aim of the manuscript is to analyze drought evolution in space and time over the period 1901-2019 in three European macro regions, namely South Europe/Mediterranean region (MED), Central Europe (CEU) and North Europe (NEU). In particular, a comparison between three different drought indices, that is SPI, SPEI and ScPDSI, is carried out.

General comments

The topic is interesting and fits with the journal aims and scopes. It is well written and organized. Although the study is not novel from a methodological viewpoint, overall, it is clear and well detailed. The results seem accurate and highlight some relevant differences in drought detection over Europe between SPI and SPEI, with special reference to those events occurred during the last decades, due to increasing temperature, and therefore evapotranspiration.

I suggest a few revisions before publication.

Specific comments

In the SPI and SPEI computation based on CRU datasets, it was assumed that monthly accumulated precipitation series were gamma distributed and the accumulated differences between monthly precipitation and potential evapotranspiration were log-logistic distributed. Although these are the probability distributions commonly used to calculate these drought indices, it would not be surprising if they did not fit all the data. Have you checked the goodness of fit of these distributions for all the grid cells series?

In the abstract (L 21), Section 2 (LL 150-151) and Conclusions (L 411), the authors talk about the application of a joint distribution to analyze compound events (i.e., drought and high temperature concurrent events). However, as they clarify at LL 155-158, they just calculate the number of occurrences of compound events based on fixed thresholds. This is rather different than applying a joint probability distribution (i.e., fit a bivariate or multivariate distribution) to model compound events. Therefore, I suggest the authors to replace "joint distribution" just with "frequency analysis of compound events".

In the compound analysis of droughts and high temperature, the occurrence of these events is based on fixed thresholds (e.g., 80th percentile for temperature and 20th for SPEI). How these thresholds have been chosen? Besides, I wonder if a sensitivity analysis has been carried out by changing the values of these thresholds. Please provide details.

There are some previous studies on drought analysis at European level identifying similar trends, which are not cited in the manuscript. For the sake of completeness, the authors should include for instance:

Oikonomou, P.D., Karavitis, C.A., Tsesmelis, D.E., Kolokytha, E., Maia, R. Drought Characteristics Assessment in Europe over the Past 50 Years (2020). DOI: 10.1007/s11269-020-02688-0

Hänsel, S., Ustrnul, Z., Ąupikasza, E., Skalak, P. Assessing seasonal drought variations and trends over Central Europe (2019). DOI: 10.1016/j.advwatres.2019.03.005

Christoph C. Raible, Oliver Bärenbold & Juan José Gómez-navarro (2017) Drought indices revisited – improving and testing of drought indices in a simulation of the last two millennia for Europe, Tellus A: Dynamic Meteorology and Oceanography, 69:1, 1287492, DOI:10.1080/16000870.2017.1296226

Bonaccorso, B., Peres, D.J., Cancelliere, A., Rossi, G. Large Scale Probabilistic Drought Characterization Over Europe (2013). DOI: 10.1007/s11269-012-0177-z

Parry, S., Hannaford, J., Lloyd-Hughes, B., Prudhomme, C. Multi-year droughts in Europe:

Analysis of development and causes (2012). DOI: 10.2166/nh.2012.024

Bordi, I., Fraedrich, K., Sutera, A. Observed drought and wetness trends in Europe: An update (2009). DOI: 10.5194/hess-13-1519-2009

With reference to the potential interconnection between droughts and heatwaves, I believe that the discussion could benefit by the comparison with the results of the following studies:

Markonis, Y., Kumar, R., Hanel, M., Rakovec, O., Máca, P., Kouchak, A.A. The rise of compound warm-season droughts in Europe (2021) . DOI: 10.1126/sciadv.abb9668

Bezák, N., Mikoš, M. Changes in the compound drought and extreme heat occurrence in the 1961–2018 period at the european scale (2020). DOI: 10.3390/w12123543

Samaniego, L., Thober, S., Kumar, R. et al. Anthropogenic warming exacerbates European soil moisture droughts. Nature Clim Change 8, 421–426 (2018).
<https://doi.org/10.1038/s41558-018-0138-5>

Minor comments

LL 91-92: provide references at the end of the sentence.

L 234: extend must be extent.

L 282: add "are" before relatively.

L 294 and L 420: add "of" after consideration.

L 329: To most must be The most.

L 361: Change SEPI in SPEI.

L 435: projected.