

Nat. Hazards Earth Syst. Sci. Discuss., referee comment RC1  
<https://doi.org/10.5194/nhess-2021-42-RC1>, 2021  
© Author(s) 2021. This work is distributed under  
the Creative Commons Attribution 4.0 License.



## Comment on nhess-2021-42

Anonymous Referee #1

---

Referee comment on "Brief communication: Appropriate messaging is critical for effective earthquake early warning systems" by Meng Zhang et al., Nat. Hazards Earth Syst. Sci. Discuss., <https://doi.org/10.5194/nhess-2021-42-RC1>, 2021

---

This is an important, interesting topic. The paper is clearly written and easy to follow.

There are a number of short-comings which should be addressed in a revised version:

1. more details on the monitoring and detection; information processing and delivery of information should be better clarified; it is not clear what training and public information was delivered prior to and how often prior to the earthquake event;
2. more details regarding the survey respondent recruitment, sampling, and representation should be included; is this a valid sample?
3. the statistical analysis is very thin; need to include at a minimum standard tests of significance, prob values, confidence interval for the comparisons between groups and categories;
4. missed opportunities for more analysis of both differences between the characteristics of those who understood and those who did not the EEWS; what is the role of education, social status, age, gender, previous experience, etc.
5. more discussion of the implications for improving earthquake warning and how to increase awareness, knowledge, comprehension and actions resulting from EEWS;
6. comparative analysis between hardware and systems between China/Sichuan and Japan/US/Mexico would be useful;

While the paper has potential, in its present form even as a brief communications, it simply raises more questions than it answers...