

Nat. Hazards Earth Syst. Sci. Discuss., referee comment RC2
<https://doi.org/10.5194/nhess-2021-382-RC2>, 2022
© Author(s) 2022. This work is distributed under
the Creative Commons Attribution 4.0 License.

Comment on nhess-2021-382

Anonymous Referee #2

Referee comment on "Assessment of building damage and risk under extreme flood scenarios in Shanghai" by Jiachang Tu et al., Nat. Hazards Earth Syst. Sci. Discuss., <https://doi.org/10.5194/nhess-2021-382-RC2>, 2022

Building damage assessment is very important in urban flood risk management. This study presents an assessment of possible exposure and damage losses of buildings in Shanghai. The topic of this study is valuable, and However, the quality and innovation of the current manuscript are not satisfactory. First of all, lots of figures are poor in quality and hard to read. Besides, the building damage assessment method used in this study lack of innovation. In any case, I have a few recommendations that I believe will help the authors to clarify their contribution and improve the readability of the text in a few passages.

Specific comments:

- More information on the urban flood modelling by extreme flood scenarios caused by storm surges, precipitation, and fluvial floods, should be provided in the study. For example, what is the detailed combination of storm surges, precipitation, and fluvial floods.
- Most of the figures in the manuscript are very poor in quality and hard to meet the standard for this journal, such as Figs. 5, not clear enough.
- Table 5 presents comparison of flood adaptation measures in Shanghai, how does it make any sense? Anyway, the discussion in this study seems meaningless.
- The building flood damage assessment method used in this study is too simple and lacks the novelty.
- Should be Figure 7 and Figure 8 instead of Fig. 7, Fig. 8 in Page 14.
- The methods of assessment of building damages in extreme floods used in this study are mainly derived from existing studies, thus what is the main contribution of this study.