

Hist. Geo Space. Sci. Discuss., referee comment RC1
<https://doi.org/10.5194/hgss-2021-15-RC1>, 2021
© Author(s) 2021. This work is distributed under
the Creative Commons Attribution 4.0 License.

Comment on hgss-2021-15

Adriano Pimentel (Referee)

Referee comment on "The bicentenary of Georg Hartung, a German pioneer geologist, explorer, and illustrator" by Carlos A. Góis-Marques et al., Hist. Geo Space. Sci. Discuss., <https://doi.org/10.5194/hgss-2021-15-RC1>, 2021

Review of the manuscript "The bicentenary of Georg Hartung, a German pioneer geologist and explorer" by Carlos A. Góis-Marques and co-authors

General comments:

In this manuscript the authors present a systematic biography of Georg Hartung, a pioneer German geologist of the 19th century, including descriptions of his travels and publication record. This tribute to Hartung includes information from multiple bibliographic sources and sheds light on his pioneer geological observations that were influenced by renown academics of that time, but certainly also inspired younger generations of scientists over the last 200 years.

I consider this manuscript appropriate for History of Geo- and Space Sciences as it represents a significant contribution to honour Georg Hartung on his 200th anniversary. I am certain it will be of interest to enthusiasts of the History of Geology, but also for those working on different geological aspects of the Atlantic islands.

The manuscript is well written and organized. The sentences are clear and objective, which makes the text easy to follow. The figures are also adequate. I have only one major comment that could enrich this manuscript: Hartung's name is mentioned in the correspondence of Charles Darwin to Charles Lyell and Joseph Dalton Hooker. Given the paramount importance of Darwin to biological but also geological sciences, I think that adding a comment about this fact would highlight the importance of Hartung's work. It seems that the geological observations made by Hartung in the Azores sparked the thought of Darwin. Besides that, there are only a few minor issues that need to be addressed before the manuscript can be considered for publication (see specific comments).

Specific comments:

Line 35: add "to" in "Madeira due to similar"

Line 38: the authors should add that Porto Santo is an island of Madeira archipelago, as it is written one might think it is in the Canary Islands

Line 43: delete "(Spain)" it is already mentioned above

Lines 45-46: the sentence "Lacking a formal geological education, in 1855 he took private geology lessons with Gustav von Leonhard (1816-1878) (Bouheiry, 2013)." is a repetition of line 29. The authors could omit here as this paragraph mainly focuses on his travels and expand in line 29

Lines 52 and 53: add "the" in "the Azores"

Lines 57: replace "in" by "of" in "co-author of a book"

Lines 57-28: the sentence "Due to his work, he receives in 1862 an honorary doctorate from the University of Konigsberg (Reifs, 1891)." is a repetition of line 30. The authors could omit here as this paragraph mainly focuses on his publication record and expand in line 30

Line 65: it seems that something is missing to connect both parts of the sentence, before and after the citations

Adriano Pimentel

Centro de Informação e Vigilância Sismovulcânica dos Açores (CIVISA)

Instituto de Investigação em Vulcanologia e Avaliação de Riscos (IVAR), Universidade dos Açores