

Topical Editor's Comment on hgss-2021-15

Kristian Schlegel (Editor)

Editor comment on "The bicentenary of Georg Hartung, a German pioneer geologist, explorer, and illustrator" by Carlos A. Góis-Marques et al., Hist. Geo Space. Sci. Discuss., <https://doi.org/10.5194/hgss-2021-15-EC1>, 2021

As Topical Editor I have examined the manuscript and the references carefully. Apart from a WIKIPEDIA entry, there exist already 3 publications about Georg Hartung which contain even more information than in the present publication:

1. Bouheiry (2013)
2. Bouheiry (2015)
3. Pinto and Bouheiry (2007)

Unfortunately (1) and (2) are in German and (3) is published in a book not easily accessible.

This the first reason for my decision below.

The manuscript constitutes an appropriate contribution commemorating the bicentenary of Georg Hartung. **This is the second reason for my decision below.**

Hartung was apparently a very skillful illustrator, many excellent illustrations in his publications prove this. (1) and (2) above contain none of his illustrations, (3) just one. The present publication contains several examples of Hartung's illustrations. - **This is the third reason for my decision below.**

The authors should put some more emphasis on Hartung's illustrations. They should not lump the illustrations together into one single figure (as number 1), but separate them (in groups) with appropriate figure captions, and may perhaps include even some more. In addition, on page 3, line 65 the authors should name the subjects in the list of Hartung's publications and not just the years of publication.

After this revision in which the authors should also take into account the remarks of the other referees (as already indicated in their reply), **I will recommend the publication of this manuscript in HGSS.**

Kristian Schlegel
HGSS Topical Editor