

Reply on RC2

Carlos A. Góis-Marques et al.

Author comment on "The bicentenary of Georg Hartung, a German pioneer geologist, explorer, and illustrator" by Carlos A. Góis-Marques et al., Hist. Geo Space. Sci. Discuss., <https://doi.org/10.5194/hgss-2021-15-AC2>, 2021

I and my co-authors would like to thank Karl-Heinz Glassmeier for the review of our manuscript. The reviewer commentary questions the novelty of our work and proposes the change of the manuscript title. In the following lines we present the reply to these comments and suggestions:

RC2: "I also found a very extensive Wikipedia entry about Georg Hartung with very similar information as provided in the present article. Also, the contribution by Pinto and Bouhéry (2007) is very detailed already. Therefore, I did not learn much more when reading the present contribution as compared to the already available information in previous publications and the web."

AC: The writing of this short tribute is to celebrate the 200th anniversary of Georg Hartung, and call attention to his work, especially in the Macaronesian Islands. To achieve this, we not only brought all pertinent bibliography written in the last decades, but we also sought and present a complete list of his contributions, which cannot be found in other published or online resources (e.g., Wikipedia). Moreover, we cite at least two coeval obituaries never cited in other papers dealing with Hartung. Pinto & Bouhéry (2007), although a fantastic contribution, lacks new details about Hartung, for instance, who inspired him to go to the Azores (Von Humboldt), among others. These details were written in two books in German with limited circulation (Bouhéry 2013; Bouhéry 2015). Our paper intends to produce not only a tribute, but also to digest all English, Spanish and German (and some Portuguese and French) bibliography into an open access paper in English. Finally, with our manuscript we want to call attention that more work could be performed to understand the contributions of this German geologist, especially in the unpublished letters to Oswald Heer and other 19th century scientists.

RC2: "I recommend to change the title into "A Tribute to Georg Hartung on the Occasion of his 200th Birthday". This would indicate the main aim of the contribution."

AC: We appreciate the suggestion made. However, we opted to maintain title unchanged, for now, as the 'type of paper' is already a 'tribute'. Adding the word 'tribute' in the title is in our opinion redundant.