

Reply on RC1

Carlos A. Góis-Marques et al.

Author comment on "The bicentenary of Georg Hartung, a German pioneer geologist, explorer, and illustrator" by Carlos A. Góis-Marques et al., Hist. Geo Space. Sci. Discuss., <https://doi.org/10.5194/hgss-2021-15-AC1>, 2021

I and my co-authors would like to thank Adriano Pimentel for the review. The suggestions and comments are indeed very relevant, and we changed our text accordingly to the proposed suggestions. In the following lines we present the reply to the comments and suggestions.

RC1. "I have only one major comment that could enrich this manuscript: Hartung's name is mentioned in the correspondence of Charles Darwin to Charles Lyell and Joseph Dalton Hooker. Given the paramount importance of Darwin to biological but also geological sciences, I think that adding a comment about this fact would highlight the importance of Hartung's work. It seems that the geological observations made by Hartung in the Azores sparked the thought of Darwin."

AC: We agree with the reviewer that the work of Hartung was indeed important to shape the thought of Darwin, Lyell, and Hooker. We included in the text the following phrase: "Hartung's exploration in the Azores is mentioned in Charles Darwin (1809-1882) letters to Joseph Dalton Hooker (1817-1911) and to Lyell (Darwin Correspondence Project: letters no. 2262, 2263, 5183, 5185), and geological data reported to Darwin were included in the 'Origin of Species' first edition (Darwin, 1959, pp. 363)."

References added:

Darwin, C.: On the origin of species by means of natural selection, or the preservation of favoured races in the struggle for life, John Murray, London, 1859.

*Darwin Correspondence Project, Letter no. 2262:
<https://www.darwinproject.ac.uk/letter/DCP-LETT-2262.xml>, last access 9 September 2021.*

*Darwin Correspondence Project, Letter no. 2263:
<https://www.darwinproject.ac.uk/letter/DCP-LETT-2263.xml>, last access 9 September 2021.*

*Darwin Correspondence Project, Letter no. 5183:
<https://www.darwinproject.ac.uk/letter/DCP-LETT-5183.xml>, last access 9 September 2021.*

*Darwin Correspondence Project, "Letter no. 5185,"
<https://www.darwinproject.ac.uk/letter/DCP-LETT-5185.xml>, last access: 9 September 2021.*

RC1. "Besides that, there are only a few minor issues that need to be addressed before the manuscript can be considered for publication (see specific comments)."

Line 35: add "to" in "Madeira due to similar":

AC: We have followed the reviewer advice and added this in our revised manuscript.

Line 38: the authors should add that Porto Santo is an island of Madeira archipelago, as it is written one might think it is in the Canary Islands

AC: We changed the phrase to "also traveling to Porto Santo (Madeira archipelago) and Tenerife (Canary archipelago)"

Line 43: delete "(Spain)" it is already mentioned above

AC: We have followed the reviewer advice and deleted the word "Spain"

Lines 45-46: the sentence "Lacking a formal geological education, in 1855 he took private geology lessons with Gustav von Leonhard (1816-1878) (Bouheiry, 2013)." is a repetition of line 29. The authors could omit here as this paragraph mainly focuses on his travels and expand in line 29

AC: We agree with the reviewer. To avoid repetition, we placed this phrase in line 29 as suggested. Moreover, we deleted the repetition.

Lines 52 and 53: add "the" in "the Azores"

AC: We have followed the reviewer advice and added this in our revised manuscript.

Lines 57: replace "in" by "of" in "co-author of a book"

AC: We have followed the reviewer advice and added this in our revised manuscript.

Lines 57-28: the sentence "Due to his work, he receives in 1862 an honorary doctorate from the University of Konigsberg (Reifs, 1891)." is a repetition of line 30. The authors could omit here as this paragraph mainly focuses on his publication record and expand in line 30.

AC: We have followed the reviewer advice and deleted this from our revised manuscript

Line 65: it seems that something is missing to connect both parts of the sentence, before and after the citations

AC: We agree with the reviewer. We modified the phrase in our manuscript to: 'Last known writings appear mainly in the journal 'Zeitschrift der Gesellschaft für Erdkunde zu Berlin' (Hartung, 1878a, 1879a, b, 1880a, 1881a, b, 1884, 1885), although further geological discussions were published in other journals (see Hartung, 1880b, 1878b).'