

Hydrol. Earth Syst. Sci. Discuss., referee comment RC3
<https://doi.org/10.5194/hess-2022-30-RC3>, 2022
© Author(s) 2022. This work is distributed under
the Creative Commons Attribution 4.0 License.

Reply on AC3

Anonymous Referee #1

Referee comment on "Investigating the effects of herbaceous root types on the soil detachment process at the species level" by Jian-Fang Wang et al., Hydrol. Earth Syst. Sci. Discuss., <https://doi.org/10.5194/hess-2022-30-RC3>, 2022

Many thanks for your responses for my comments. Although you have carried out a one year's experiment, the data are not nearly enough to support your research objectives (Investigating the effects of herbaceous root types on the soil detachment process at the species level). Also, your current responses are reasonable but cannot improve the manuscript's scientific significance. For example, the results shown in the Fig.7 are your main research results; however, as I stated in the Major issue 4 "If the datasets used to build Eq. 10 are in turn used to validate Eq. 10, the result is nonsense.", your response for the comment tells me that Eq. 10 is not validated.

I am very sorry for giving you some disappointing comments. However, I really suggest you to further improve the manuscript.