Hydrology and Earth System Sciences Discussions

Hydrol. Earth Syst. Sci. Discuss., referee comment RC2
https://doi.org/10.5194/hess-2021-540-RC2, 2022

Comment on hess-2021-540

Shuangmin Duan (Referee)

Referee comment on "Technical note: Efficient imaging of hydrological units below lakes and fjords with a floating, transient electromagnetic (FloaTEM) system" by Pradip Kumar Maurya et al., Hydrol. Earth Syst. Sci. Discuss., https://doi.org/10.5194/hess-2021-540-RC2, 2022

Dear all,

This paper introduces a new towed floating TEM instrument through model studies and several case studies. The structure is very clear of this paper and straightforward. I think the authors have taken good studies to illustrate the capabilities of the new system.

I read the comments from the first referee Craig and the authors' responses. Some of my questions have been answered. Thus, here I only list the comments which I still hold.

Except for the application results of the instrument, I also expect more figures about the technical parts. Beyond table 1, I would prefer to see a figure of the waveform of the transmitted current and in Appendix-A I have expected to see your processing result of the transients, the error bars and the data fitting of your inversion, which can also provide a lot of information about how your instrument performs.

When designing the instrument, you considered the water resistivity, depth, the TX current moment and so on to get a higher DOI. But what is the influence of the RX-TX offset on DOI. Why is a 9 m offset?

How do you estimate DOI for these inversion examples?

In the instruction part, the author should also include the surface towed and deep dragged EM setups for hydrologic applications, such as groundwater explorations in shallow sea

areas presented by Micallef et al., (2020) and Gustafson et al., (2019). Maybe you could find more.

Line 107 and 109: spelling 40m2->40m2

Line 117: "The model resolution study was also used in the design of the **SW-FloaTEM** system", I guess here you want to say "The model resolution study was also used in the design of the **FW-FloaTEM** system"?

Line 133-135: I am confused with this expression "For the inversion, no lateral constraints were applied. However, for the model parameter analysis lateral constraints were assumed between 5 similar neighboring models (based on the true model) to simulate the improved resolution capabilities from information sharing when working with field data." Since this is a 1D inversion, how do you use lateral constraints? And what do you mean here on "model parameter analysis"?

Figure 5: The y-axis is confusing. What does positive and negative elevation mean? Where is the water depth? Below profile A-A', you make some legend as water, Gyttja, Sand and Clay. This makes me confused at the beginning since in the figure you use purple as the sand layer but in the legend you use yellow. But later I realized the legend only serves for the drilling B1 and B2. Maybe you could find a better way to display them.

Figure 5: Do you use interpolation to display profile A-A', since it is laterally smooth. If yes, what kind of interpolation do you use and what side effect this will bring? Why between 600-800 m, the DOI is so shallow, limited only to the upper 20 m?