Referee Comment on hess-2021-54
Al-Kuisi Mustafa

Community comment on "Delineation of dew formation zones in Iran using long-term model simulations and cluster analysis" by Nahid Atashi et al., Hydrol. Earth Syst. Sci. Discuss., https://doi.org/10.5194/hess-2021-54-CC1, 2021

The manuscript entitled “Delineation of Dew Formation Zones in Iran Using Long-Term Model Simulations and Cluster Analysis” presents valuable results about the dew potential in Iran during a long-term period (40 Years) that can be utilized for strategic planning to harvest due water as an alternate source of water that can be used for agricultural purposes.

In general, the manuscript is well written, well structured, and technically sound.

I recommend for publication in the Print-Form in Hydrology and Earth System Sciences after minor revisions.

Specific Comments:

The model input consists of an extensive meteorological data-base that is transformed and processed to be usable according to the model setup. However, equation 1, which is related to the scaling of the wind speed from 10 meters to 2 meters, has limitation that need to be addressed in brief.

The cluster analysis is a powerful tool to identify the principle groups in the model results. The authors used this method in a brilliant way to identify the dew formation zones and match them with the climate zones in Iran. The authors used Ward’s minimum variance method (Ward, 1963) to determine the number of groups (clusters) to define the dew formation zones as shown in Figure 5 and led to six zones. Why six zones were the optimal number? Is it possible to reduce the number of zones?

As a semi-arid climate in the majority of Iran, it is valuable to make a brief comparison between the total amount harvestable dew water and compare it with the total amount of rainfall over Iran. Here, the comparison should not be for the total amount but rather to compare with rainfall depth. The comparison is vital to show that the harvestable dew yield is close to the rainfall depth in some regions.

From the model simulation it looks clear that the regions that received due potential
are actually the same ones received the heights rainfall during the year and among Iran. How can this redistribution of the harvestable dew water can enhance to replace the scarcity of water in other regions in Iran such the central and eastern parts that receive the lowest amounts of rainfall and the least potential for dew formation? This is only from a strategic point view to utilize the importance of this study.

It is known that Iran is not the only semi-arid country in the region. How the authors can elaborate the results to be utilized in other similar countries like middle east countries and Afghanistan, Iraq, Syria, Jordan and Gulf countries.

Afterall, this kind of modelling studies is needed and recommended in the region. This study has revealed valuable information and understanding about the potential of dew harvesting in such semi-arid regions.