

Hydrol. Earth Syst. Sci. Discuss., referee comment RC2
<https://doi.org/10.5194/hess-2021-404-RC2>, 2021
© Author(s) 2021. This work is distributed under
the Creative Commons Attribution 4.0 License.

Comment on hess-2021-404

Lenka Slavíková (Referee)

Referee comment on "Barriers to mainstream adoption of catchment-wide natural flood management: a transdisciplinary problem-framing study of delivery practice" by Thea Wingfield et al., Hydrol. Earth Syst. Sci. Discuss.,
<https://doi.org/10.5194/hess-2021-404-RC2>, 2021

First of all, I need to admit that I really enjoyed reading the paper. I positively evaluate the construction of the field research and especially how precisely the work was done and presented. This is not usual for the stakeholder evidence-based papers. I also think that paper is easy to read and that the main findings are highlighted. Also, the paper is well connected to existing NBS/NFM debates and devotes the part for terminological problem.

I missed one aspect that could be added in introductory/review parts before the own methodology is introduced: That is the one of self-engagement of land owners in NBS implementation and how this (rare) self-engagement is viewed (criticized) by FRM experts. Under the pressure of climate change, some land-owners are willing to restore historically changed hydrological conditions of their land, often at their own cost or giving up (agricultural) subsidies for missed production. This engagement shall be cherished and scaling-up potential shall be investigated (as this behavior moves out one of the key barriers – land-owner resistance). But what about coordination problem? I do not insist this debate must be incorporated in the paper, but if authors are open to do so, they might start with: https://link.springer.com/chapter/10.1007/978-3-030-23842-1_6 and follow with responses on this piece:
https://link.springer.com/chapter/10.1007/978-3-030-23842-1_7 and
https://link.springer.com/chapter/10.1007/978-3-030-23842-1_8.

Overall, I fully support the paper for the publication and congratulate the authors for the great work.