

Hydrol. Earth Syst. Sci. Discuss., referee comment RC1 https://doi.org/10.5194/hess-2021-196-RC1, 2021 © Author(s) 2021. This work is distributed under the Creative Commons Attribution 4.0 License.

Comment on hess-2021-196

Anonymous Referee #1

Referee comment on "Macroinvertebrate habitat requirements in rivers: overestimation of environmental flow calculations in incised rivers" by Renata Kędzior et al., Hydrol. Earth Syst. Sci. Discuss., https://doi.org/10.5194/hess-2021-196-RC1, 2021

General Comments:

The authors test the influence of river incision on environmental flow estimation based on the macroinvertebrate index using data from 12 waterbodies in Poland.

The topic is interesting and is one of the emerging trends in environmental and ecological studies.

The introductory remarks justify the theme and are well presented.

I suggest to add few sentences to better introduce environmental/minimum flow estimation.

The other background information are up to date and provide sufficient informations to put this work in the international context.

The sampling campaign is well described in the methods and is suitable for the aim of the study.

The statistical analyses should be described in detail to be possible to evaluate their robustness, I would expect a substantial revised paragraph in the next version.

Discussion and conclusion sections are generally well written, supported by the results but sould be compared with the corrent literature and putted in the international context.

Detailed comments:

See the attached PDF with comments

Please also note the supplement to this comment:

https://hess.copernicus.org/preprints/hess-2021-196/hess-2021-196-RC1-supplement.pdf