

Geosci. Model Dev. Discuss., referee comment RC2
<https://doi.org/10.5194/gmd-2021-36-RC2>, 2021
© Author(s) 2021. This work is distributed under
the Creative Commons Attribution 4.0 License.



Comment on gmd-2021-36

Anonymous Referee #2

Referee comment on "Assessment of stochastic weather forecast of precipitation near European cities, based on analogs of circulation" by Meriem Krouma et al., Geosci. Model Dev. Discuss., <https://doi.org/10.5194/gmd-2021-36-RC2>, 2021

Review of the manuscript "Assessment of stochastic weather forecast of precipitation near European cities, based on analogs of circulation" by M. Krouma et al.

This is a very interesting manuscript, owning a good potential to become a high impact paper with positive repercussions on different societal sectors. A stochastic rain generator is produced exploiting the relationship between Z500 and precipitation in different European cities. The work is worth publication, but it needs a substantial revision about three distinct points:

- 1 - an improved description of the methodology is needed, in order to better understand the workflow and some of the choices that have been employed.
- 2 - the use of the prolonged ERA5 dataset (since 1950) is urged, in order to understand whether the differences in skill with NCEP are actually due to the length of the analog database, or to the database itself.
- 3 - a thorough and comprehensive revision of the English language is needed. Many subject-predicate inconsistencies, missing s', wrong sentence structures make some parts of the manuscript very hard to read.

Specific comments are stored in the attached files. In bold font, those that pertain to the above-mentioned major observations.

Please also note the supplement to this comment:

<https://gmd.copernicus.org/preprints/gmd-2021-36/gmd-2021-36-RC2-supplement.pdf>