Comment on gmd-2021-333
Juan Antonio Añel

Dear authors,

After checking your manuscript, it has come to our attention that it does not comply with our Code and Data Policy.

https://www.geoscientific-model-development.net/policies/code_and_data_policy.html
You include several links in the Code Availability and Data Availability sections. However, they are not suitable repositories. The web pages you link do not assure long-term archival of the code necessary to reproduce your work. Therefore, we can not accept them. Both in the case of the Noah-LSM model and the Genetic Algorithm, you could want kindly ask the developers to storage the versions used in your work in one of the repositories that we can accept. Or you could offer to do it for them, given that they make it freely downloadable.

One additional problem is that both codes do not have a license listed. The Genetic Algorithm code contains kind of a copyright statement, but it does not address many issues. Despite what many developers think, if a software piece does not include a license, the code continues to be their property, and others cannot use it. Therefore, you could ask the developers to include a license with their code, or at least for the GA to choose ‘Other’. For licenses, we recommend the GPLv3. You only need to include the file ‘https://www.gnu.org/licenses/gpl-3.0.txt’ as LICENSE.txt with your code. Also, you can choose other options that Zenodo provides: GPLv2, Apache License, MIT License, etc.

Similarly, for the data used, we would like to request that you store in a permanent repository (including DOI) the final input data (not generic reanalysis data) and output files.

In this way, before the Discussions stage is closed, you must reply to this comment with the link to the repository for the code and the corresponding DOI. Also, you must include in a potential reviewed version of your manuscript the modified ‘Code and Data Availability’ section and the DOI of the code.

Please, reply as soon as possible to this comment with the link for it.

Juan A. Añel
Geosc. Mod. Dev. Executive Editor