

Geosci. Model Dev. Discuss., referee comment RC2
<https://doi.org/10.5194/gmd-2020-400-RC2>, 2021
© Author(s) 2021. This work is distributed under
the Creative Commons Attribution 4.0 License.



Reviewer comment on gmd-2020-400

Stuart Clark (Referee)

Referee comment on "Automated geological map deconstruction for 3D model construction using *map2loop* 1.0 and *map2model* 1.0" by Mark Jessell et al., Geosci. Model Dev. Discuss., <https://doi.org/10.5194/gmd-2020-400-RC2>, 2021

This article is in an important area for geology - building models of the subsurface quickly, using all or most available data and highlighting uncertainties. The paper is an important contribution in terms of the software that it is offering for the community and demonstrating this software with a series of datasets in a case study. However, the article suffers from a number of issues that mean that I would advise the authors reorganising the paper, running some additional benchmarking and documenting how efficient the code is as well as how it works in terms of datatypes and inputs and outputs. The paper would also benefit from a better review of the literature in places, especially the introduction and discussion. The comments below are as detailed as I could be to improve the paper and should not require a lot of additional scientific work, mainly rewriting and organising the text.

See my detailed comments in the file attached.

Please also note the supplement to this comment:

<https://gmd.copernicus.org/preprints/gmd-2020-400/gmd-2020-400-RC2-supplement.pdf>