

Geosci. Commun. Discuss., referee comment RC1
<https://doi.org/10.5194/gc-2021-30-RC1>, 2021
© Author(s) 2021. This work is distributed under
the Creative Commons Attribution 4.0 License.

Comment on gc-2021-30

Tobias Schmiedel (Referee)

Referee comment on "V3Geo: a cloud-based repository for virtual 3D models in geoscience" by Simon J. Buckley et al., Geosci. Commun. Discuss., <https://doi.org/10.5194/gc-2021-30-RC1>, 2021

Dear Editor, dear authors,

It was a pleasure to read the article titled "V3Geo: A cloud-based repository for virtual 3D models in geoscience" written by Simon John Buckley, John Anthony Howell, Nicole Naumann, Conor Lewis, Magda Chmielewska, Kari Ringdal, Joris Vanbiervliet, Bowei Tong, Oliver Severin Mulelid-Tynes, Dylan Foster, Gail Maxwell, and Jessica Pugsley. In this article they present a tool/platform to make 3D geological data accessible for example for teaching, but also accompanying publications and just as shared data. The article is well written and without being aware of this upcoming publication, I actually used the V3Geo earlier this year to publish data for a publication. Hence, I first hand experienced the workflow and can confirm the suggested user experience in the article.

Nevertheless, I do have two minor comments (accepted subject to minor revisions), which I would like the authors to address:

- Could the authors clarify what the difference (advantages/disadvantages) are between e-rock? Since e-rock, seems to be a very similar to V3Geo and thus in disagreement to the authors statement: "*Although these studies highlight the practical benefits of web-based sharing of 3D models in geoscience, no current single repository has been presented for scientific and professional purposes. Solutions are limited in file (and therefore dataset) size, precluding many of the details needed for interpretation, do not allow supplementary interpretations or datasets, or are too broad in scope, covering all areas of society rather than being tailored to the geoscience community*" (Line 72-75) Regarding the interpretation of data sets – V3Geo seems to me from a user perspective not yet different to other solutions on the market. Is the data interpretation only possible via Lime or did I overlook some of the features. Please clarify.
- The authors mentioned the V3Geo platform has been designed to handle different scales of model (microscopic, hand specimens, outcrop, etc. (See Line 11-12, 26-27) However, the text is only talking about outcrop-models. Will the focus stay on outcrop

models? Will V3Geo take at the same time hand samples into account, making it more similar to e-rock? Similar, what about the microscopic scale? Are these mentioned, because the platform could be used as a framework for similar data platform related to microscopic samples? Please explain, why the mention of microscopic when the text is all about outcrop scale?

Best regards,

Tobias Schmiedel