

Earth Surf. Dynam. Discuss., referee comment RC3  
<https://doi.org/10.5194/esurf-2022-34-RC3>, 2022  
© Author(s) 2022. This work is distributed under  
the Creative Commons Attribution 4.0 License.

## Comment on esurf-2022-34

Anonymous Referee #2

---

Referee comment on "Response of modern fluvial sediments to regional tectonic activity along the upper Min River, eastern Tibet" by Wei Shi et al., Earth Surf. Dynam. Discuss., <https://doi.org/10.5194/esurf-2022-34-RC3>, 2022

---

The manuscript conducted a series of grain size analysis for modern fluvial sediments from the upper Min River, Eastern Tibet and then tried to indicate the control of tectonic activity on fluvial sediments. Although the authors provided some data of grain size distribution of the modern fluvial sediments along the upper Min River channel, the relationship between sedimentary grain size and tectonic activity is far away to be reach. In fact, as stated by the manuscript itself, there are many factors to determine the grain size distribution of fluvial sediments, including climate, vegetation, hydrology, geomorphology, lithology, and fault slip rate etc. Thus, it is lack solid evidence for their implication.

- No question was raised for solving in the Introduction, so I cannot catch the significance of the study. In fact, nearly all discussion or implications are common knowledge, without solid contribution.
- There are coarse sediments and gravels along the Min River, but no data for these depositions.
- There is no rule to divide the river into four segments in the main text, but it was divided into three segments in Abstract and conclusion.
- For the sections of "Climate controlled fine grained fluvial sediments" and "Coarse grained deposits controlled by tectonism", there is no solid evidence for either.
- There is no new implication in the conclusion section, just for weak or enhanced tectonic activity, nothing with grain size distribution of fluvial sediments.
- There are lots of grammar and typo mistakes.