

Earth Surf. Dynam. Discuss., editor comment EC1  
<https://doi.org/10.5194/esurf-2022-23-EC1>, 2022  
© Author(s) 2022. This work is distributed under  
the Creative Commons Attribution 4.0 License.

## **Comment on esurf-2022-23**

Rebecca Hodge (Editor)

---

Editor comment on "Development of a machine learning model for river bedload" by  
Hossein Hosseiny et al., Earth Surf. Dynam. Discuss.,  
<https://doi.org/10.5194/esurf-2022-23-EC1>, 2022

---

This paper has received a range of reviewer comments. I would be happy to see a response from the authors indicating how they will address these reviews. The response needs to show how the work will be modified to address the comments and/or to provide a well justified rebuttal. I suggest that the authors focus most on the two sets of more substantial comments from Gomez and Referee #4. One theme is that the authors have not engaged with some recent literature that is of direct relevance to this work. The authors will need to consider the papers suggested by the reviewers and make it clear that their work has taken into account the ideas in those papers. Some of the other reviewers suggest that this work is not novel compared to existing literature, but unfortunately do not identify specific papers that the authors have missed. I encourage the authors to ensure that they have thoroughly searched the literature for relevant work. Some of the reviewers also question whether further analysis is necessary. The authors need to justify their choice of method, both in terms of the machine learning approach and in the selection and application of the bedload transport dataset.