

Earth Surf. Dynam. Discuss., editor comment EC1
<https://doi.org/10.5194/esurf-2021-88-EC1>, 2022
© Author(s) 2022. This work is distributed under
the Creative Commons Attribution 4.0 License.

Comment on esurf-2021-88

Frances E. G. Butcher (Editor)

Editor comment on "Modeling the spatially distributed nature of subglacial sediment transport and erosion" by Ian Delaney et al., Earth Surf. Dynam. Discuss., <https://doi.org/10.5194/esurf-2021-88-EC1>, 2022

Dear authors,

I have considered the three reviews we have received for your manuscript. All 3 reviewers have raised some concerns. R1 is largely positive and suggests moderate revisions, R2 sees potential in the manuscript but finds major revisions required. R3 also raises issues and recommends rejection.

As R1 and R2 see value in the paper when the concerns are addressed, I would encourage you to respond to the concerns of all three reviewers.

Notably: All want to see improvements/corrections to the model description, and all query aspects of the model assumptions. R2 and R3 both find (different) problems with the model equations that need addressing and/or explaining. Importantly this explanation needs to justify whether these issues cause problems for the rigor of your findings. R1 and R3 also raise concerns about the case studies the model is applied to - out of three case studies total, the value of two are queried by R1 and R3 (different case studies and different reasons).

I look forward to reading your responses to the reviewers' comments.

Best wishes

Frances Butcher