

Earth Surf. Dynam. Discuss., editor comment EC1
<https://doi.org/10.5194/esurf-2021-87-EC1>, 2022
© Author(s) 2022. This work is distributed under
the Creative Commons Attribution 4.0 License.



Comment on esurf-2021-87

Edward Tipper (Editor)

Editor comment on "The effect of lithology on the relationship between denudation rate and chemical weathering pathways – evidence from the eastern Tibetan Plateau" by Aaron Bufe et al., Earth Surf. Dynam. Discuss., <https://doi.org/10.5194/esurf-2021-87-EC1>, 2022

This manuscript has now received two detailed reviews, one anonymous, and one by J. Baronas (very detailed). Both these reviews provide a positive evaluation of the manuscript. Overall, I agree with the reviewers that this is a well written manuscript and well constructed piece of science and I encourage you to submit a response to the reviewers and a revised manuscript.

Although the comments by the reviewers are relatively straightforward to address, they are important and will help get this manuscript the visibility that it deserves.

All the comments of the reviewers be considered as a point by point basis and fully addressed in the revised manuscript. Based on my reading of the manuscript, and the reviewers, I suggest the following points be given careful consideration.

Missing references are highlighted by both reviewers. I think their suggestions are valid, and if possible, should be incorporated.

R2 suggests that a more specific title might be useful, potentially providing a greater impact for this work and I think this is worth considering very seriously.

The source of sulfate raised by R2 is important. As a minimum I suggest the uncertainty associated with the assumption that all SO₄ is from pyrite be taken into account. What about hot springs for example?

The points raised by R1 about the inclusion of rain and hot springs in the inversion model but then were corrected for confused me also. This needs clarification.