

Earth Syst. Sci. Data Discuss., referee comment RC3  
<https://doi.org/10.5194/essd-2022-77-RC3>, 2022  
© Author(s) 2022. This work is distributed under  
the Creative Commons Attribution 4.0 License.

## Comment on **essd-2022-77**

Anonymous Referee #3

---

Referee comment on "SEIA: a scale-selective eddy identification algorithm for the global ocean" by Yikai Yang et al., Earth Syst. Sci. Data Discuss.,  
<https://doi.org/10.5194/essd-2022-77-RC3>, 2022

---

The paper presents a new algorithm for detecting and tracking eddies from SLA AVISO maps. While the new ideas are interesting, the way the algorithm is presented as being threshold-free is unconvincing. The validation part lacks also a comparison with eddy detection and tracking other datasets such as the official AVISO product (Mesoscale Eddy Trajectories Atlas Product).

I would recommend major revisions and have some remarks:

- \* why only choosing the 2015-2019 period? are there specific reasons for that?
- \* you claim that for your method "No arbitrary values are set", can you explain why you chose  $c=1$  in equation (1)?
- \* Setting  $Dt=125\text{km}$  as a fixed threshold seems to be against your idea of presenting an algorithm that is non parametric. Can you elaborate? I would prefer if you presented your new ideas without putting much focus in selling it as a parameter-free algorithm
- \* Moschos et al. were not the first to introduce deep learning techniques for eddy detection. Replace "introduced" by "presented".
- \* "but there are few precedents due to limited datasets" needs reference.
- \* The English writing needs to be improved