Comment on essd-2022-343
Giuseppe M.R. Manzella

Chief editor comment on "Southern Europe and Western Asia Marine Heat Waves (SEWA-MHWs): a dataset based on macro events" by Giulia Bonino et al., Earth Syst. Sci. Data Discuss., https://doi.org/10.5194/essd-2022-343-CEC1, 2022

Dear Authors

Thank you for your interest in publishing your manuscript in ESSD. I regret to inform you that this manuscript is fitting ESSDscope.

As pointed out by one referee ‘From a methodological point of view, the manuscript is certainly interesting for the community. The proposed methodology to take into account shifts toward warmer climate is something we have to deal with and the way the authors tackle this is worth reading. The clustering analysis of macro events is valuable, although the authors did not attempt to associate driving synoptic (atmospheric) conditions to each clusters, something that was the reason for the clustering in Stefanon et al 2012. However, this is likely beyond the mere description of the dataset required by ESSD.’

I need to add that ESSD is requiring data coming from mature methodologies approved by the scientific reference community. Furthermore, a comparison with in situ information is lacking, verification being based on past RS analysis. Finally the methodology is applied only to the Mediterranean and it is not a regional application of a more general ‘global’ methodology.

In conclusion, the paper is not fitting the ESSD requirements, but it has a scientific value. For this reason we encourage you to submit it to a more appropriate RS journal.