

Earth Syst. Sci. Data Discuss., referee comment RC1
<https://doi.org/10.5194/essd-2022-331-RC1>, 2022
© Author(s) 2022. This work is distributed under
the Creative Commons Attribution 4.0 License.

Comment on essd-2022-331

Anonymous Referee #1

Referee comment on "Not just crop or forest: building an integrated land cover map for agricultural and natural areas" by Melanie Kammerer et al., Earth Syst. Sci. Data Discuss., <https://doi.org/10.5194/essd-2022-331-RC1>, 2022

This study tried to merge the information from two types of gridded images, i.e., the LANDFIRE National Vegetation Classification (NVC) and USDA-NASS Cropland Data Layer (CDL). The methods used for producing the integrated gridded maps are straightforward, but my concerns are mainly related to the novelty and the usefulness of such dataset. Simply put, the authors allocated more specific crop information from CDL on NVC images. Thus, I doubt its novelty to be published in ESSD. Besides, the ground-truth data were unclear (how many samples, where they distribute, how the samples were collected etc.). Nonetheless, it doesn't matter because the validation of the produced data was actually the validation of NVC map since no improvement was done for the NVC data.