

Comment on **essd-2022-267**

Anonymous Referee #3

Referee comment on "A geodatabase of historical landslide events occurring in the highly urbanized volcanic area of Campi Flegrei, Italy" by Giuseppe Esposito and Fabio Matano, Earth Syst. Sci. Data Discuss., <https://doi.org/10.5194/essd-2022-267-RC3>, 2022

The paper presents an Inventory of historic landslides from a region in Italy based on a compilation of various datasets such as previously published landslide inventories and historic sources.

The paper is well written and the landslide inventory is undoubtedly relevant for local planning and mitigation purposes.

However, i'm not sure if the area/scope of the database is of relevance to a general geoscience community as is the scope of ESSD "high-quality data of benefit to Earth system sciences". Either the authors need to thoroughly make the relevance much clearer or the paper is not fit for publishing in ESSD. Furthermore the database needs more explanation and documentation/discussion as mentioned below and in the specific comments which means it also has shortcomings both within "well-documented and highly useful data products "

General comments:

We need a discussion of biases in the dataset:
temporal (old slides might be under reported??)
volumetric: (large landslides might be overrepresented)
etc.

How complete is the landslide? what is your estimate, can you quantify

Compare dataset to other datasets/landslides published in ESSD and elsewhere.

you mention climate ongoing climate change in the abstract but not in the text. You need to explain why/how climate change will affect landslides in your area and how your database can be applied to mitigate this (if possible). Alternatively remove the mention of climate change. ut i think that would be a shame not to include.

You need to explain/justify (much more) why this dataset is relevant to a wider geoscience community (outside a purely local audience).

See specific comments in PDF file.

Please also note the supplement to this comment:

<https://essd.copernicus.org/preprints/essd-2022-267/essd-2022-267-RC3-supplement.pdf>