

Earth Syst. Sci. Data Discuss., editor comment EC1
<https://doi.org/10.5194/essd-2021-55-EC1>, 2021
© Author(s) 2021. This work is distributed under
the Creative Commons Attribution 4.0 License.



Comment on **essd-2021-55**

Nellie Elguindi (Editor)

Editor comment on "UV-Indien network: ground-based measurements dedicated to the monitoring of UV radiation over the western Indian Ocean" by Kevin Lamy et al., Earth Syst. Sci. Data Discuss., <https://doi.org/10.5194/essd-2021-55-EC1>, 2021

Dear authors,

Thank you for your submission to ESSD. Based on the first two reviews, I recommend that you carefully consider whether or not you can demonstrate the usefulness of this dataset. This purpose of ESSD is to publish data sets that can be used by others. As pointed out by reviewer 2, ground-based observations are usually used to validate satellite data/model output. Although a thorough inter-comparison is presented in the paper, it is not clear which dataset is being validated. Can an argument be made that the UV-Indien network can be considered as the ground-truth and perhaps be used to evaluate models and satellite observations? If this can not be demonstrated, then I would agree with the reviewers that it is not suitable for publication in ESSD and advise you to consider publication in another journal.

On the other hand, if a strong argument for this can be made, then I suggest the authors follow the recommendations of both reviewers and shift the focus of the manuscript to be more on the details of how the data was gathered and processed as outlined by the reviewers. In addition, re-orient the intercomparison of the data products to demonstrate how the UV-Indien network can be used to validate other data products (e.g. satellite observations, model output). Efforts should also be made in making the data product more user friendly.

If you choose to submit a revised version, please make sure to address each of the reviewers' comments, point by point.

Please let me know if you have any further questions.

Best regards,

Nellie Elguindi