

Earth Syst. Sci. Data Discuss., author comment AC3
<https://doi.org/10.5194/essd-2020-309-AC3>, 2021
 © Author(s) 2021. This work is distributed under
 the Creative Commons Attribution 4.0 License.



Reply on RC1

Polina Enchilik et al.

Author comment on "Total contents and mobile fractions of chemical elements within a soil toposequence in the south-east of the Valdai Hills, Russia" by Polina Enchilik et al., Earth Syst. Sci. Data Discuss., <https://doi.org/10.5194/essd-2020-309-AC3>, 2021

We thank Reviewer #1 for thoughtful and supportive comments.

We revised the manuscript. And we hope that the revised version of the manuscript became better.

Comment

Response

First, scientific English language is below any standards in this paper. The authors should ask a native English speaker or a professional translator to revise the text.

The revised version of the manuscript was corrected by a professional translator and by a native speaker.

Second, there are some disappointing mistakes in soil classification

Thank to Professor Gerasimova, the names of soils studied were corrected professionally.

Table 1, the first soil: Stagnic should go before Glossic, Profondic is a secondary qualifier, and thus should go after the name of the RG.

We have corrected the name of the first soil. The corrected name is Endocalcaric Albic Neocambic Stagnic Glossic Retisols (Geoabruptic, Chromic, Loamic).

Table 1, the second soil: Stagnic should go before Glossic, Profondica is a secondary qualifies, and the soil should be either Ochric or Himic, but not both of them.

We have corrected the name of the second soil. The corrected name is Endocalcaric Albic Neocambic Stagnic Glossic Retisols (Geoabruptic, Ochric, Lamellic).

Table 1, the fourth soil: Profondic is a secondary qualifier.

We have corrected the name of the fourth soil. The corrected name is Endocalcaric Glossic Albic Histic Stagnosols (Glebafruptic).

Table 1, the fifth column: please change all the commas to decimal points

We have changed all the commas to decimal points in fifth column.

Table 1, the sixth column: prism-like structure does not exist in any international classification, though I can imagine what You mean. Please refer to FAO or USDA manuals for field soil description

In sixth column, we have replaced prism-like structure with prismatic structure.

Figures 2 and 3: please try to follow internationally accepted terminology. I do not understand the expression "upper slope". Do You mean shoulder or backslope position?

We have replaced «upper slope» with «backslope» in figures 2 and 3 and throughout the text.

May we regard "upper footslope" and "lower footslope" as footslope and toeslope accordingly?

We have replaced «upper footslope» and "lower footslope" with «footslope» and «toeslope», respectively.

Please also note the supplement to this comment:

<https://essd.copernicus.org/preprints/essd-2020-309/essd-2020-309-AC3-supplement.pdf>