

Earth Syst. Sci. Data Discuss., editor comment EC1
<https://doi.org/10.5194/essd-2020-308-EC1>, 2021
© Author(s) 2021. This work is distributed under
the Creative Commons Attribution 4.0 License.



Comment on **essd-2020-308**

David Carlson (Editor)

Editor comment on "Climate-Biogeochemistry Interactions in the Tropical Ocean: Data collection and legacy" by Gerd Krahnemann et al., Earth Syst. Sci. Data Discuss., <https://doi.org/10.5194/essd-2020-308-EC1>, 2021

Authors as well as followers of this discussion will know that we received careful thoughtful comments from four very-experienced reviewers. In my charge to those reviewers, I asked each reviewer to assess specific questions: 1) Have authors organized their list in a useful manner?; 2) Does this represent a good summary of their SFB activities?; 3) Will the catalog prove useful to oceanographers looking at marine oxygen?; and 4) Does the product belong in ESSD?

Reviewers have responded with an overwhelmingly negative assessment. These reviewers either insist on major revisions (two of four) or call for outright rejection (remaining two). In no case does any of us diminish the long decade of important accomplishments under SFB funding to GEOMAR. We do however find that a post-hoc catalog does not add value or certify quality as ESSD and its readers expect.

I recommend that lead author Gerd Krahnemann consult with co-authors. They should not attempt to prepare rebuttals to all evaluations nor should they make any further effort on substantial revision.