



EGUsphere, chief editor comment CEC1
<https://doi.org/10.5194/egusphere-2022-618-CEC1>, 2022
© Author(s) 2022. This work is distributed under
the Creative Commons Attribution 4.0 License.

Comment on egusphere-2022-618

Juan Antonio Añel

Chief editor comment on "HIDRA2: deep-learning ensemble sea level and storm tide forecasting in the presence of seiches – the case of the northern Adriatic" by Marko Rus et al., EGU sphere, <https://doi.org/10.5194/egusphere-2022-618-CEC1>, 2022

Dear authors,

Unfortunately, after checking your manuscript, it has come to our attention that it does not comply with our "Code and Data Policy".

https://www.geoscientific-model-development.net/policies/code_and_data_policy.html

Your manuscript fails to comply because of several issues. I list them below and expect that you address and fix them as soon as possible.

- First, regarding code: the Hidra 2 model does not have a license listed. If you do not include a license, despite you publishing it, the code is not available to use by anyone; it continues to be your property. Therefore, add a license to your code in Zenodo. You could want to choose a free software/open-source (FLOSS) license. We recommend the GPLv3. You only need to include the file '<https://www.gnu.org/licenses/gpl-3.0.txt>' as LICENSE.txt with your code. Also, you can choose other options that Zenodo provides: GPLv2, Apache License, MIT License, etc.

- Secondly, you use the UTIDE package. However, this package is stored on GitHub, as you mention in the list of References. UTIDE is released under the MIT license so that you can copy it. Therefore, as GitHub is not a suitable repository (GitHub itself instructs authors to use other alternatives for long-term archival and publishing, such as Zenodo), please, publish UTIDE (maintaining the MIT license) in one of the appropriate repositories, and reply to this comment with the relevant information (link and DOI).

- Also, your manuscript is about a learning method. As this technique heavily depends on the input data, and the reproducibility of the work is compromised without it, we request that you publish in the repositories for your paper the input and output files used in your work. In the Code and Data Availability section, you mention in a generic way the MARS retrieval system. This is not enough. You must publish the specific data used as input. If variables are taken from a larger file, you can post simply the input data taken from them and used. For outputs, nothing prevents you from publishing them.

Finally, you use the NEMO model. However, you do not provide the NEMO code. You simply cite a pdf file, listed in the references, stored in a webpage that is not a trustable repository. Also, you do not identify the NEMO version used for your work. All these issues must be fixed. First, you must clearly state in your manuscript the NEMO version that you

use. Then you must provide in the Code and Data Availability section a link to a trustable repository containing it. Many papers on the development of NEMO have been published in our journal, and in this way many NEMO versions are already stored in Zenodo. You could want to check if it is the case of the version you have used and simply cite its current Zenodo repository. If not, please, create a new one.

Please, reply as soon as possible to this comment with all the information requested above, so it is available for the Discussions process as it should be. Note that your manuscript should have never been accepted for Discussions with all the mentioned flaws, this was an oversight from the Topical Editor, and we are trying to fix it now. Also, please, be aware that failing to comply with this request could result in rejecting your manuscript for publication. Moreover, you must include in any reviewed version of your manuscript the modified 'Code and Data Availability' section with all the new information requested.

Juan A. Añel

Geosci. Model Dev. Exec. Editor