



EGUsphere, referee comment RC4
<https://doi.org/10.5194/egusphere-2022-469-RC4>, 2022
© Author(s) 2022. This work is distributed under
the Creative Commons Attribution 4.0 License.

Comment on egusphere-2022-469

Anonymous Referee #4

Referee comment on "Wetting and drying cycles, organic amendments, and gypsum play a key role in structure formation and stability of sodic Vertisols" by Sara Niaz et al., EGU sphere, <https://doi.org/10.5194/egusphere-2022-469-RC4>, 2022

This topic is very interesting, and the authors did a lot work about it. However, in my opinion, the manuscript needs a lot revision before acceptance.

First of all, during the Introduction section, some brief information should be given about organic amendments and gypsum effects on soil structure or aggregates. The aims of the study should be rewritten, since the WD was not the only factor we concerned. Secondly, there were multifactor we need to addressed in the study, including gypsum addition or not, four organic amendments, and different runs of wetting drying. Suggest authors use two-way or three-way analysis of variance to give concise results. Please recheck the dose of PAM addition in the text and Table 3. Check some grams, for instance "Na, Ca, Mg, K" in L189, which should be in ionic forms. Also, "cahnge" in L245. In Discussion section, it was badly manner to explain the results, which made me lost. The authors should write in a clear way to explain the aim they concerned. Suggest substantial revision on the section.