



EGUsphere, referee comment RC1
<https://doi.org/10.5194/egusphere-2022-223-RC1>, 2022
© Author(s) 2022. This work is distributed under
the Creative Commons Attribution 4.0 License.

Comment on egusphere-2022-223

Neil Macdonald (Referee)

Referee comment on "Reliability of flood marks and practical relevance for flood hazard assessment in southwestern Germany" by Annette Sophie Bösmeier et al., EGU sphere, <https://doi.org/10.5194/egusphere-2022-223-RC1>, 2022

I really enjoyed reviewing this paper, it provides an excellent examination on the precision, accuracy and utility of using historical flood marks within flood risk analysis. It presents a detailed and well considered analysis of multiple flood marks across three communities within a single catchment in SW Germany. It demonstrates how such information can be embedded within and used to support and question conventional flood risk assessments.

I have provided an annotated copy of the manuscript with comments, minor amendments and thoughts, I hope that the authors find this helpful in making their revisions. I only have one substantive point that I feel the authors need to address.

The authors identify the issue of local base changes in surface level in determining local flood mark heights, I feel they need to provide a couple of sentences/a paragraph detailing how they overcame the risk of such changes in their site assessments and also within their analysis of the records. Did they attempt to assess changes in ground level at sites, was this assessed when considering changes in level over time, is there the potential to make some statement about how the relative levels may reduce over time as urban surfaces build up/rates of urban surface change? Even if they are unable to account for this some discussion would be beneficial within the methods section.

If you have any questions in relation to the annotated comments, please get in touch.

Neil Macdonald, University of Liverpool

Please also note the supplement to this comment:

<https://egusphere.copernicus.org/preprints/2022/egusphere-2022-223/egusphere-2022-223-RC1-supplement.pdf>