EGUsphere, editor comment EC1
https://doi.org/10.5194/egusphere-2022-1229-EC1, 2023

Comment from co-editor on egusphere-2022-1229

Heini Wernli (Editor)

Editor comment on "Investigating multiscale meteorological controls and impact of soil moisture heterogeneity on radiation fog in complex terrain using semi-idealised simulations" by Dongqi Lin et al., EGUsphere,
https://doi.org/10.5194/egusphere-2022-1229-EC1, 2023

Dear Dr. Lin

As you have seen, you received two very thoughtful, constructive, but also critical reviews of your paper. While both reviewers regard the topic and general approach as interesting and promising, they both conclude that, in its present form, the analysis of the results is incomplete and does not support some of the main statements made in the abstract and conclusions. Also, parts of the paper seem to be distracting (touching on themes that are not relevant for the study), while other parts are too short, including the explanation of the simulation setup and the analysis of the physical processes in the model simulations. One reviewer suggests major revisions and the other to reject the paper in its current form. First of all, I invite you to submit detailed final author comments where you can reply to the points raised by the reviewers.

You can then decide whether you prefer to withdraw the paper, take your time to do more in-depth analyses and submit the revised version as a new submission (to ACP or an other journal), or whether you prefer to stay in the loop and continue the review process with a strongly revised version. In any case, a more detailed analysis of the modelled processes will be required for a much better understanding of the fog event, and it would be necessary to produce new diagnostics to analyze more deeply the processes driving the fog life cycle and the spatial heterogeneities, and the role of soil humidity.

With best regards,
Heini Wernli