

Clim. Past Discuss., editor comment EC1
<https://doi.org/10.5194/cp-2021-137-EC1>, 2022
© Author(s) 2022. This work is distributed under
the Creative Commons Attribution 4.0 License.

Comment on cp-2021-137

Mary Gagen (Editor)

Editor comment on "Humidity changes and possible forcing mechanisms over the last millennium in arid Central Asia" by Shengnan Feng et al., Clim. Past Discuss., <https://doi.org/10.5194/cp-2021-137-EC1>, 2022

Comments from the editor to the authors:

I am pleased to invite you consider a major revision of your manuscript and resubmission for consideration. We have now received 3 reviewers comments in the interactive discussion for your manuscript and they range in response considerably. I would like to invite you to consider all comments carefully and prepare a response to each. As the reviews are quite wide ranging I would particularly highlight the need to consider the points below in order for consideration of a revised manuscript.

On the relationship with ENSO:

From reviewer 1 - the need to explain and discuss the change in relationship between the humidity index and ENSO over time. This is critical as time instability in the correlation must be addressed. Reviewer 2 also considers some references not properly considered on ENSO - please address this and see comments on the need to include references that also indicate an unstable hydroclimate during the LIA over the region.

Need to include additional references:

See comments from reviewers 1 and 2 on the need to include additional references related primarily to ENSO. Also please see Reviewer 3s comments on the need to address literature gaps on palaeolimnology, hydroclimate changes in the LIA and the need to increase the discussion of background Holocene information of relevance in the introduction.

Methodology and results details:

See reviewer 3's comments re the need to increase the detail on the background lithology and study site description.

With best wishes,

Mary Gagen