

## ***Interactive comment on “Mid-Holocene climate change over China: model-data discrepancy” by Yating Lin et al.***

**Yating Lin et al.**

haibin-wu@mail.iggcas.ac.cn

Received and published: 5 February 2019

We greatly appreciate the constructive comments and suggestions on the previous version of the manuscript from editor. We have attempted to address every point raised. The following is the outline of the changes we have made, with reference to the order of the comments made by the editor.

Comments from editor: 1. Archiving data Input data Comments: Ideally, the pollen assemblages for each site, at least for the 6ka should be made available (e.g. in trusted archives). The biographic reference must be included for each of the sites. Many citations in Table 1 are not listed in the reference, list.

Response: The biographic reference for each site is included in Table 1 (on pages 42-

[Printer-friendly version](#)

[Discussion paper](#)



45 in revised version), and the citations have been added in the reference list. About the pollen assemblages, we provide the biome type at 6 ka for each pollen site in Table S4 (on pages 5-12 in revised version).

Comments: All the original data must be archived in a vetted repository and a citation should be linked to them.

Response: The original data can't be shared without the permission from authors of them, but we have already give the reference of them in Table 1, full information could be obtained if the readers send request to the authors.

Comments: Climate simulations: the citations in Table 3 are not listed in the reference list. This should be amended.

Response: The citations in Table 3 are added in reference list (line 888-890, 536-539, 803-808, 581-583, 632-636, 437-441, 740-753, 504-508, 515-525, 836-839, 540-548, 918-922 in revised version).

Output data Comments: all reconstructed climate variables and the biomes for each site at 6ka should be archived (the values for the colored dots in Figs. 2-4).

Response: these values are provided in Table S4 (on pages 5-12 in revised version).

Comments: the simulated values for each of the climate variables (the colored bars in Figs. 2-4).

Response: For the simulated values, we think the grid mean values in the colored bars in Figs. 2-4, and the spatial patterns in Figs. S1-6 are enough to show the discrepancies between model-data for climate change during mid-Holocene over China. Of course, if the editor insists it's necessary, we can also provide the simulated values for each pollen site of the climate variables from all 13 models.

Comments: basic metadata for each site (the information listed in Table 1)

Response: Provided in Table 1.

[Printer-friendly version](#)[Discussion paper](#)

2. The “data availability” section Comments: it should include the doi/url that links to the output data from this study and the reiterates the location of the input data (above). Alternatively, locations of the input data can be provided in the table.

Response: We prefer to provide our data directly in a Table (like Table S4) instead of putting them in a vetted repository.

3. Other reminders Comments: Of course, the authors might also want to make the digital data for their maps available, or anything that they think might be useful for future studies.

Response: For now, we think all these information about our input and output data are enough, of course, we are open-minded to other possible requests.

Comments: A special attention to the reference list is required. The references marked as red in the attached file are missing in the reference list. The author should also check lines 483, 637 and 694 of their reference list. Is CQPD 2000 or 2001 or both? And also please note the supplement to this comment: <http://www.clim-past-discuss.net/cp-2018-145-Ec1-supplement.pdf>.

Response: It's CQPD 2000, and all these missing and errors in the reference list are modified in the revised version.

The revised version of manuscript and supplementary information are enclose below as supplement.zip.

Please also note the supplement to this comment:

<https://www.clim-past-discuss.net/cp-2018-145/cp-2018-145-AC1-supplement.zip>

Interactive comment on Clim. Past Discuss., <https://doi.org/10.5194/cp-2018-145>, 2018.

Printer-friendly version

Discussion paper

