

Biogeosciences Discuss., referee comment RC2
<https://doi.org/10.5194/bg-2022-181-RC2>, 2022
© Author(s) 2022. This work is distributed under
the Creative Commons Attribution 4.0 License.

Comment on bg-2022-181

Anonymous Referee #2

Referee comment on "The dispersal of fluvially discharged and marine, shelf-produced particulate organic matter in the northern Gulf of Mexico" by Yord W. Yedema et al.,
Biogeosciences Discuss., <https://doi.org/10.5194/bg-2022-181-RC2>, 2022

The manuscript entitled "The dispersal of fluvially discharged and marine, shelf-produced particulate organic matter in the northern Gulf of Mexico" by Yedema and coauthors takes advantage of the combination of organic geochemistry and palynology to determine the origine of sedimentary organic matter and ecological niches in the northern Gulf of Mexico.

The description of geochemical data is complete and discuss the relative abundance of GDGTs, long chain diols and, more classical for this type of study, n-alkanes, alkenones and sterols, leading to assumption on the fate of soil derived, fluvially derived and marine OM.

This is a nice descriptive paper, well-written (even if, as a non-native english speaker, I can not evaluate the use of English language). My only concern is about the apparent lack of a scientific question. The issue of the fate of terrestrial OM at the land-sea interface is, of course, important for C cycling, but the introduction could indicate why and how the present results will contribute to create new knowledges. Assumptions are formulated to discuss the relative preservation of the different sources of terrestrial OM, then there is just to make this point explicit.

Finally, in order to be more efficient on the use of money and energy, I suggest for further research that, at this stage of the knowledges on the northern Gulf of Mexico system, it could be interesting to test hypotheses on the fate of OM with a specific sampling strategy or using experimentations instead of formulating assumptions after the sampling.

This article is close to being published after minor revisions.