

Biogeosciences Discuss., community comment CC1 https://doi.org/10.5194/bg-2021-37-CC1, 2021 © Author(s) 2021. This work is distributed under the Creative Commons Attribution 4.0 License.

Comment on bg-2021-37

Oliver Dilly

Community comment on "Slowdown of the greening trend in natural vegetation with further rise in atmospheric CO_2 " by Alexander J. Winkler et al., Biogeosciences Discuss., https://doi.org/10.5194/bg-2021-37-CC1, 2021

The over all importance of the study for a multidisciplinary and interdisciplinary readership is unclear. The manuscript addressed modeled greening. After carefully reading over several hours I inserted some comments in the attached manuscript. The role of carbon dioxide enrichment seems in general unclear. The species-specific response need to be included and discussed with reference to the species prevalent in the biomes.

The manuscript is overall very detailed on the methodological approach. Results and discussion should be separated. This should allow the separation of the modeled in comparison to evidence-based effects of the greening including the role of carbon dioxide, for a multidisciplinary and international leadership of biogeosciences.

These points and comments from earlier comments in the discussion should be carefully included in the MS.

Please also note the supplement to this comment: https://bq.copernicus.org/preprints/bq-2021-37/bq-2021-37-CC1-supplement.pdf