

Biogeosciences Discuss., editor comment EC1
<https://doi.org/10.5194/bg-2021-245-EC1>, 2022
© Author(s) 2022. This work is distributed under
the Creative Commons Attribution 4.0 License.

Comment on bg-2021-245

Jack Middelburg (Editor)

Editor comment on "The influence of near-surface sediment hydrothermalism on the TEX₈₆ tetraether-lipid-based proxy and a new correction for ocean bottom lipid overprinting" by Jeremy N. Bentley et al., Biogeosciences Discuss.,
<https://doi.org/10.5194/bg-2021-245-EC1>, 2022

Dear Dr. Ventura and colleagues:

Thanks for submitting your paper to Biogeosciences. The topic is of interest to a wide audience, and I have read it with pleasure. However, after your paper has been made available in the Biogeosciences discussion forum, some issues were brought to my attention (see below). These issues need to be resolved, or at the least require your attention before I will contact referees to evaluate your manuscript further.

- Sections 2.2 and 2.3 of this BG submission are almost 100 % identical to sections 2.3 and 2.5 of the OG paper (Bentley et al, 2021) that has been published. (It appears that through an unfortunate timing the Ithenticate software did not detect this overlap at the time of submission and my preliminary evaluation). The rest of the text has no substantial overlaps.
- The introduction of the paper needs attention: some of the referencing is inaccurate and I recommend articulating clearer the relations with the Bentley et al. paper (in terms of differences in focus, overlap in sampling sites, methods, etc).
- If you use maps that have been published before, this should be clearly communicated to the reader and permission asked if needed (because of copy-right issues). Most scientists slightly modify maps for this reason.
- Clearly communicate to the reader the similarities and differences in samples, sites, methods, etc. between this and your prior paper on lipid biomarkers in the Cathedral Hill hydrothermal vent system.

I therefore invite you to upload a revised manuscript in which all issues identified have

been solved (and others you might detect while further scrutinizing your paper). I will then consult the referees again to have a look at your revised paper.

With best regards,

Jack Middelburg, handling associate editor Biogeosciences