

Biogeosciences Discuss., referee comment RC5  
<https://doi.org/10.5194/bg-2021-135-RC5>, 2021  
© Author(s) 2021. This work is distributed under  
the Creative Commons Attribution 4.0 License.



## Reply on RC4

Axel Kleidon (Referee)

---

Referee comment on "Comment on K. Michaelian and A. Simeonov (2015) "Fundamental molecules of life are pigments which arose and co-evolved as a response to the thermodynamic imperative of dissipating the prevailing solar spectrum"" by Lars Olof Björn, Biogeosciences Discuss., <https://doi.org/10.5194/bg-2021-135-RC5>, 2021

---

There are two issues involved here:

1. Is the claim by Michaelian & Simeonov (2015) valid or useful? Here I side with the skeptical attitude of the author of the commentary and with William Martin. I do not believe MS2015, and doubt that it has much value. So there would be quite a bit that can be criticized, but this criticism in its own needs to be well justified and substantiated.
2. Is the commentary by Björn well justified and substantiated? As I expressed in my review, it is not. For a commentary, I would expect something stronger and better argued, and I gave an example of how such a commentary could look like in the review. In the case of MS2015, I think that such a more substantial commentary would be easy to do.

Because of (2.), I recommend rejection of this comment.